Training Session Plan

Would’ve Could’ve Should’ve
The role of health workers in human rights issues

Developed by: Alicia Dibbets
The International Federation of Health and Human Rights Organisations (IFHHRO)

IFHHRO forms a unique network of active organisations committed to the protection and promotion of health related human rights. Members and observers are human rights groups which address health-related rights violations, medical associations involved in human rights work, and organisations that have been created specifically to mobilize health workers for human rights protection.

For more information visit our website: www.ifhhro.org

Copyright © IFHHRO, 2011

This session plan may be reproduced provided the source is specified. IFHHRO welcomes applications for rights of translation. Copies of the session plan in a different format can be requested. More information: ifhhro@ifhhro.org

Cover: Illustration by Arita Charoensuk
Learning Objectives
- To understand the roles that health workers (can) play in relation to health related human rights
- To become aware of their own position and their personal standpoint towards the role of health workers

Target Group
Health workers
Basic knowledge about human rights is helpful

Duration
90 minutes

Materials
- Masking tape or Blu-Tack
- Markers
- Sheets of flipchart paper
- Coloured paper
- Envelopes
- (transparent coloured plastic)

Training Aids
1. Cards for visible and invisible actors
2. Overview of visible and invisible actors
3. Roundabout question cards
4. Spheres of influence diagram

Session Plan
This session plan focuses on the role health workers can play in relation to health related human rights in general. The roundabout questions in Training Aid 3 cover different human rights related health themes. As this session plan has been developed for a mixed international audience please be encouraged to adjust these questions to fit the local context where necessary. The session can also be used to focus on the role of health workers in relation to one specific health and human rights theme by changing the roundabout questions accordingly and selecting a story on this theme for step 1. A thematic version of this session is available under the title: ‘Would’ve Could’ve Should’ve’: The role of health workers in sexual and reproductive rights issues’.

The session works best in combination with introductory sessions about human rights in relation to health. These introductory sessions, as well as related follow-up sessions, can be found online in the IFHHR Training Manual ‘Human Rights for Health Workers’ at www.ifhhr-training-manual.org
**Preparation**

Print two copies of Training Aid 1 on coloured paper and cut out the cards. Keep the two sets of cards separate. If necessary, make additional cards for actors relevant to the story selected and leave out cards with actors that are not relevant to the story (see steps 1 & 2).

Also copy and cut out the cards from Training Aid 3 and place each set of eight cards in a separate envelope with the letter of the set (A, B, C, D or E) written on the envelope. How many copies of each set of cards are necessary will depend on the amount of participants. There should be one envelope with cards for every two participants (see step 4).

Hang a sheet of flipchart paper on a wall or board where everyone can see it. Copy the sphere of influence diagram (Training Aid 4) without the dotted line onto another sheet of flipchart paper. A circle can be cut out of transparent coloured plastic to cover the area of the diagram up to where the dotted line should be, or the dotted line can be drawn in during the session (see step 5).

**Step 1  Personal Story (10 minutes)**

Introduce the session by telling the participants that during this session they will look at the different roles that health workers play and can play in relation to health related human rights.

Immediately proceed by recounting a story where a health worker is involved in an incident with a patient that has human rights implications. This can be a description of a situation where a patient’s human rights were at stake, but the health worker did not realise this until later or a situation where the health worker knew a patient’s human rights were not respected, but did not take action. The story should serve as an example of the way health workers inevitably play a role in the health related human rights of their patients through their daily work.

Suggestions for story plots:

- A health worker becomes impatient with a diabetes patient who is not administering the insulin s/he keeps prescribing. Only later the health worker finds out insulin is often not available at the patient’s local pharmacy, and the patient has no refrigerator to store a supply of insulin.
- A health worker is confronted with a patient with complications due to an illegal abortion who lies about the cause of her predicament. (For the full story see: ‘Would’ve Could’ve Should’ve’: The role of health workers in sexual and reproductive rights issues’)

*Tip: It can be effective to invite a health worker to present a personal experience to the participants.*

**Step 2  Visible and invisible actors in the story (20 minutes)**

This step aims to visually map out the different actors in the story to start thinking about the role and position of health workers. You will need one set of cards from Training Aid 1 and the two sheets of flipchart paper that have been hung up. The overview should be created together with the participants by first prompting them to name different actors and then pasting the cards with the actors on the sheets of flipchart paper. The aim is to end up with an overview similar to the one in Training Aid 2. Also encourage participants to name relevant actors that have not been included on the cards, these should be written down and pasted in the overview as well.
The outline below gives an indication of how this step can be filled in. The questions provided can be used to start participants thinking about the role of health workers in relation to human rights.

Start by asking the participants who the two main actors are in the story (Patient, Health Worker). Also request the participants to name any other characters from the story. Paste the cards on the flipchart sheets, as indicated in Training Aid 2.

Next, turn back to what happened in the story.

What took place when you look at the facts of the story from a purely medical perspective?

What issues come to the forefront if you start looking at the story from a human rights perspective?

What may have influenced the doctor’s actions and attitude?
Why did the patient respond in the way that s/he did?

Which other actors played a role?

Point out that the persons that have been identified are the visible actors, but that there are also numerous invisible actors that have a direct or indirect role in what happens in the story. Encourage the participants to name the actors that may have an influence on the health worker’s side, the patient’s side and in general.

Possible actors within the medical sphere:
Colleagues of the health worker
Superiors of the health worker
Professional Association
Education institute that the health worker attended

Possible actors within the patient's sphere:
Family
Community
School teachers
Employer

General actors:
Media
Government
Society

When the overview is complete pose the following questions to the participants asking them to think from the perspective of human rights.

When you think about human rights:
Who is the most important person in the story?
The answer should be: the patient. If participants do not come up with this answer continue with the following question:
Whose human rights are at stake?
Answer: the patient.

When you think about the rights of the patient:
Who is potentially the most influential actor in this situation?
The answer should be: the health worker. If participants name other, powerful actors continue with the following question:
Who is directly confronted with the patient's situation?
Answer: the health worker

What can a health worker do to change a situation like the one presented in the story?
What would you do? (Use this question to lead towards the next step of the session.)

**Step 3 Roundabout (20 minutes)**
Divide the participants into two groups of the same amount of participants. Instruct one group to stand in a circle facing outward. Then ask the second group to form a circle around the other group with each participant facing another participant in the inner circle to form a pair. If there is an odd number of participants a facilitator needs to take part in this exercise.

Hand out an envelope with question cards from Training Aid 3 to each participant in the outer circle.

Explain the exercise to the participants as follows:
- each envelope contains a number of questions that address the role of health workers
- these questions are not a test, there is not one correct answer, instead the questions should be answered based on a personal viewpoint
- the aim is therefore not to discuss the questions in detail but to give a primary reaction
- if a participant does not want to answer a question they can skip it
- first the participants in the outer circle pose questions from their envelope to their partner in the inner circle
- after 5 minutes the participants in the outer circle move one place to the left so that new pairs are formed
- the participants in the outer circle hand their envelope to their new partner to ask the questions
- repeat this step (move to the left – hand over envelope) two more times
- it does not matter how many questions are asked during one round, participants can just carry on with the questions during the next rounds.

The following diagram illustrates the four round of the exercise with 16 participants:
Step 4  Discussion Questions (10 minutes)
Debrief by asking the following questions:

Which type of questions were easy to answer? Why?
Which type of questions were difficult to answer? Why?

Step 5  Spheres of influence (25 minutes)
Explain to the participants that the roundabout questions cover three different levels at which health workers play a role in relation to human rights. Copy the diagram from Training Aid 4 onto two sheets of flipchart paper. Start by drawing the inner circle (individual patient care) followed by the middle circle (work sphere) and then the outer circle (outside the work sphere).

Ask the participants where the different actors identified from the story fit into these three different areas. Use the second set of cards from Training Aid 1 to paste the different actors within the circles. The health worker and the patient should be pasted in the inner circle, but where the other actors are placed can depend on the participants. Also include any additional actors that participants have named during step 3.

Follow-up with the following questions:

Where does the primary role of the health worker lie?
Answer: individual patient care.

In what sphere does a health worker have the most influence on whether human rights are respected?
Answer: individual patient care.

In which spheres can obstacles occur that prevent a health worker from being able to uphold human rights of patients?
Answer: in all three spheres

Use a few questions from the roundabout to illustrate what type of obstacles might occur within the different spheres:

Inner circle
An unequal hierarchical power relationship between provider and patient based on unequal level of knowledge, or socio-economic differences can have a negative effect on care delivery.

Middle circle
Regulations within your hospital determine that spousal consent is a prerequisite for women’s access to health services.

Outer circle
Use of morphine for pain treatment has received so much negative media attention that health workers have started to refuse to prescribe morphine to relieve patients’ pain.

Explain that the spheres of influence work both ways:
What a health worker does in the inner circle also has influence outside this sphere. At the same time what occurs within the outer circle and the middle circle can influence a health worker’s capacity to uphold human rights within the inner circle.
A health worker’s professional responsibilities lie within the inner circle but also stretch outside this sphere to actors in the middle circle. At this point the transparent coloured circle can be placed onto the diagram to illustrate the area where the professional responsibilities of health workers lie. Alternatively, a dotted line can be drawn to demarcate this area. What actions a health worker takes beyond the sphere of professional responsibilities will depend on the individual and the specific context. Ask participants whether they agree and leave room for discussion.

**Step 6 Conclusion (5 minutes)**
Conclude the session by summarizing the key message:
- Through their daily work health workers inevitably play a role in relation to the health related human rights of patients.
- How far this role reaches beyond the work sphere depends on multiple factors including the viewpoint, position, connections, and abilities of the individual health worker.
Training Aid 1 – Cards for Visible and Invisible Actors

doctor

patient

colleagues
superiors

medical

school

medical

association

family
government

media
Training Aid 2 – Overview of Visible and Invisible Actors

- Government
- Media
- Society
- Community
- Family
- School Teachers
- Employer

- Superiors
- Colleagues
- Education Institute
- Professional Association
- Health Worker
- Patient
- Other Actors

© IFHRO
As a health worker there are many opportunities in daily work to make a difference.

What do you think?

Health workers can influence public policy by providing accurate information about health issues. This means having to gain access to policy makers.

Do you think you could do this?

Your superior discovers that you have been providing independent medical examinations for prisoners against the rules of the prison authorities. You are warned that you will lose your job if you continue to do this.

What would you do?

Daily work is time-consuming and stressful enough as it is without also trying to address broader health related human rights issues.

How do you feel about this?
An unequal hierarchical power relationship between provider and patient based on unequal level of knowledge, or socio-economic differences can have a negative effect on care delivery.

What do you think?

Information materials on common health problems are only available at your clinic in the official language of the country. Quite some visitors of the clinic speak a different language.

What would you do?

Health and human rights should be part of all medical curricula.

What do you think?

On a visit to a hospital in another country you have seen a children’s ward decorated with colours and pictures on the walls. The contrast with the bare children’s ward you are used to is striking.

Would you do anything with this back at work?
ENVELOPE B

The opinion of a patient is more important than the opinion of the partner or family.

Do you agree or disagree?

Your colleague has lost her job because she wrote a piece for the newspaper exposing the very poor conditions in psychiatric institutions. You were involved in the research for the article.

Would you continue working on this issue?

It has come to your attention that your superior routinely refuses to examine patients after finding out they are HIV positive.

Would you: tell your colleagues / confront your superior / inform your superior’s superior / make a formal complaint / do something else?

Health workers are in an exceptional position to effectuate change in the field of health and human rights because they have medical expertise, first-hand experience, connections, social status…

What do you think?
Autonomy and empowerment of the patient should be the basis of a provider – patient relationship.

What do you think?

The hospital where you work is located in a poor neighbourhood. People often come to the hospital asking for medical help that they cannot afford.

Do you think it is worth trying to set up a free clinic?

A patient tells you that she is being pressured by her community to choose a different healthcare provider because they have seen you on TV denouncing the practice of female genital mutilation.

How would you respond?

Health workers should have a say in government decisions about health issues that affect their work.

What do you think?
The socio-economic context of a patient should always be taken into account.

Do you agree or disagree?

You have been asked to act as a witness in a court case concerning human rights abuses that took place in your hospital.

Would you be prepared to do this?

Regulations within your hospital determine that spousal consent is a prerequisite for women’s access to health services.

Would you: follow this rule / ignore this rule / try to change this rule / do something else?

Do you ever feel so overwhelmed by the amount of problems related to health and human rights that it becomes difficult to know where and how to start making a difference?
**ENVELOPE C**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>It is the task of a health worker to make sure that a patient is aware of all options for treatment including the potential risks, benefits, implications, outcome and nature of the procedure.</th>
<th>It has come to your attention that medical files of patients are easily accessible to anyone working at your hospital.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>What do you think?</td>
<td>Would you: discuss the pro’s and con’s with colleagues / leave things as they are / try to introduce a new system / do something else?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Taking action to promote health and human rights can simply mean vocalizing experience and knowledge at the right opportunity.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Do you ever find opportunities to do this?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

**When you think changes should be made in your health facility it is not always easy to find out if colleagues share this opinion and if they are willing to take joint action.**

| How would you find out? |
The primary role of a health worker is to provide the highest possible standard of care to individual patients.

What do you think?

After having appeared on a radio show to encourage victims of domestic violence to seek help you start receiving anonymous threats.

Would this influence your decision whether or not to continue advocating on this issue?

Substitution therapy for drug users has been legalized in the country, but the hospital for which you work prohibits this type of therapy under any circumstance.

What would you do with patients with a drug addiction who would benefit from substitution therapy?

Challenging existing systems and beliefs requires a tremendous amount of confidence that not many people have.

What do you think?
You have attended a course about human rights in relation to health care.

Would you raise awareness among your colleagues about what you have learned?

The father of a patient comes to your office demanding that you stop giving his sixteen year old daughter (your patient) advice on contraceptive methods.

How would you address this?

Use of morphine for pain treatment has received so much negative media attention that health workers have started refusing to prescribe morphine to relieve patients’ pain.

Is this understandable?

It is not always clear how human rights can help solve issues in the health system.

What do you think?
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>A health worker’s attitude towards a patient is equally important as professional knowledge and skills. <strong>Do you agree or disagree?</strong></th>
<th>Challenging existing practices in the health system that do not conform with human rights can mean becoming publicly involved in controversial issues. <strong>Would you still do it if this is the case?</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>It is practice within a clinic that indigenous people are always treated last, no matter what their condition. <strong>What would you do if you worked in this clinic?</strong></td>
<td>Health related human rights of patients are an integral part of a health worker’s profession. <strong>What do you think?</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ENVELOPE E

The government of your country has enacted a new law according to which certain essential medicines are no longer covered by the national health insurance.

How would you deal with this in daily practice?

The employer of a patient calls your office to find out whether his employee / your patient has been diagnosed with tuberculosis.

How would you respond?

Gender inequality is an obstacle to improving sexual and reproductive health care.

Do you agree or disagree?

Health workers should inform their patients that they have human rights related to health.

What do you think?
Training Aid 4 – Spheres of Influence Diagram